



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND THE PRESS

7th Edition

VOLUME 1

M. David Lepofsky

Fall 2017

Storage

**KE
4418
.L46
2017
v.1**



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND THE PRESS

7th Edition

VOLUME 1

M. David Lepofsky

CASEBOOK 1

CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1. INTRODUCTION 2

2. THIS CASEBOOK..... 5

3. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS..... 5

CHAPTER 2
BASIC PRINCIPLES OF CHARTER INTERPRETATION

1. INTRODUCTION..... 6

2. BASIC APPROACH TO CHARTER INTERPRETATION - THE ROLE OF THE COURTS9

Law Society of Upper Canada v. Skapinker, [1984] 1 S.C.R. 357.....9

Reference re. Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act, R.S.B.C. 1979, c. 288 10

 (*B.C. Motor Vehicle Reference*), [1985] 2 S.C.R. 486 10

3. PURPOSIVE APPROACH TO THE CHARTER..... 12

Hunter v. Southam Inc., [1984] 2 S.C.R. 145 12

4. UNCONSTITUTIONAL PURPOSE AND EFFECTS OF A LAW..... 14

 a) Purpose and effect in the adjudication of substantive rights-bearing provisions:..... 14

R. v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd., [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 14

R. v. Jones, [1986] 2 S.C.R. 284..... 16

 b) Purpose and effect in adjudication under s. 1 of the Charter: 17

R. v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd., [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 17

5. TEST FOR APPLYING SECTION 1..... 18

 (a) Reasonable and Demonstrably Justified Limits..... 18

R. v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd., [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 18

R. v. Oakes, [1986] 1 S.C.R. 103 19

R. v. Edwards Books and Art Ltd., [1986] 2 S.C.R. 713 22

 (b) Elaborations on the Standard 23

Irwin Toy Limited v. Quebec (Attorney General) [1989] 1 SCR 927 23

R. v. Chaulk [1990] 3 S.C.R. 1303..... 25

McKinney v University of Guelph [1990] 3 S.C.R. 229 28

Alberta v. Hutterian Brethren of Wilson Colony [2009] S.C.J. No. 37 33

 Notes and Questions 41

 (c) Prescribed By Law..... 42

Re Ontario Film and Video Appreciation Society and Ontario Board of Censors (1983) 41 O.R. (2d) 583..... 42

Slaight Communications Inc. v. Davidson [1989] 1 S.C.R. 1038..... 43

R. v. Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society [1992] 2 S.C.R. 606 44

6. CONTEXTUAL AND NON-CONTEXTUAL APPROACHES TO CHARTER ADJUDICATION..... 47

<i>Edmonton Journal v. Alberta (Attorney General)</i> , [1989] 2 S.C.R. 1326.....	47
7. STANDING TO SEEK CHARTER RELIEF	49
<i>R. v. Big M Drug Mart Ltd.</i> , [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295	49
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1989] 1. S.C.R. 927	51
8. APPLICATION OF CHARTER -- GOVERNMENT ACTION VERSUS PRIVATE ACTION	53
<i>R.W.D.S.U v. Dolphin Delivery</i> , [1986] 2 S.C.R. 573.....	54
<i>McKinney v. University of Guelph</i> [1990] 3 S.C.R. 229	55
<i>Hunter v. Southam</i> [1984] 2 S.C.R. 145.....	58
<i>R. v. Gayme; R. v. Seaboyer</i> (1991) 83 D.L.R. (4th) 193 SCC.....	59
<i>Schacter v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , (1992) 93 D.L.R. (4th) 1.....	62
9. THE PRICINPLE OF PRECEDENT IN CHARTER CASES.....	65
<i>Canada (Attorney General) v. Bedford</i> [2013] S.C.J. No. 72	65
Notes and Questions	71

CHAPTER 3

PRE-CHARTER CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTION FOR FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

1. INTRODUCTION	73
2. IMPLIED BILL OF RIGHTS JURISPRUDENCE.....	74
<i>Reference re Alberta Statutes</i> , [1938] S.C.R. 100	74
<i>Boucher v. The King</i> , [1951] S.C.R. 265	75
<i>Saumur v. Quebec</i> , [1953] 2 S.C.R. 299	76
<i>Switzman v. Elbling</i> , [1957] S.C.R. 285	77
<i>McKay v. the Queen</i> , [1965] S.C.R. 798	78
<i>Nova Scotia Board of Censors v. McNeil</i> , [1978] 2 S.C.R. 662.....	79
<i>A.-G. Canada and Dupond v. Montreal</i> , [1978] 2 S.C.R. 770.....	80
<i>A.-G. Canada v. Law Society of B.C.; Jabour v. Law Society of B.C.</i> [1982] 2 S.C.R. 307.....	82
Notes and Questions	82
3. THE CANADIAN BILL OF RIGHTS.....	84
Notes and Questions	85

CHAPTER 4

PURPOSES AND FUNCTIONS OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION

1. INTRODUCTION	87
2. LEARNED COMMENTARIES ON THE PURPOSES FOR FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	88
John Stuart Mill; <i>On Liberty</i> ; (Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1985)	88
Alexander Meiklejohn; <i>Free Speech and Its Relation to Self-Government</i> ; (New York: Kennikat Press, 1972).....	90
Thomas I. Emerson, "Toward a General Theory of the First Amendment", 72 <i>Yale L.J.</i> 877 (1963)	94
Vincent Blasi; "The Checking Value in First Amendment Theory" (1977) <i>American Bar</i>	

<i>Foundation Research Journal</i> 521.....	102
Notes and Questions	104
3. THE HOLMES CORRESPONDENCE	105
Letter: <i>Learned Hand to Oliver Wendell Holmes</i> , June 22, 1918	107
Letter: <i>Oliver Wendell Homes to Learned Hand</i> , June 24, 1918.....	108
Letter: <i>Oliver Wendell Homes to Harold Laski</i> , July 7, 1918	109
Notes and Questions	109
4. JUDICIAL COMMENTARIES ON THE PURPOSES FOR FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	111
a) The Charter's Purposes Generally:.....	111
<i>R. v. Oakes</i> , [1986] 1 S.C.R. 103	111
b) The Purposes of Freedom of Expression:	112
<i>Abrams v. United States</i> , 250 U.S. 616 (1919)	112
Notes and Questions	114
<i>Reference re. Alberta Statutes [the Alberta Press case]</i> , [1938] S.C.R. 100	115
Notes and Questions	116
<i>R.W.D.S.U. v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</i> , [1986] 2 S.C.R. 573	118
<i>Ford v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1988] 2 S.C.R. 712	121
Notes and Questions	122
<i>R. v. Keegstra</i> , [1996] 1 S.C.R. 458	123
<i>Canada (A.-G.) v. Committee for the Commonwealth of Canada</i> [1991] 1 S.C.R. 139.....	126

CHAPTER 5

THE FREE SPEECH AND PRESS CLAUSES OF THE U.S. CONSTITUTION

1. INTRODUCTION	132
2. INTRODUCTION TO THE U.S. CONSTITUTION.....	133
Law Society of Upper Canada; <i>Public Law Teaching Materials -- Bar Admission Course, 1988-89</i> , Chapter 19: "Litigating Charter Claims: Legal, Factual and Evidentiary Ammunition"	133
3. USING AMERICAN CONSTITUTIONAL JURISPRUDENCE IN CHARTER CASES.....	134
M. David Lepofsky; <i>Open Justice: The Constitutional Right to Attend and Speak About Court Proceedings</i> ; (Toronto: Butterworth's, 1985), Chapter 5: The Canadian Legal Position Under the Charter of Rights.....	136
4. THE EARLY YEARS -- EVOLVING THE CLEAR AND PRESENT DANGER TEST	139
<i>Schenck v. United States</i> , 249 U.S. 47 (1919)	139
<i>Abrams v. United States</i> , 250 U.S. 616 (1919)	140
<i>Whitney v. California</i> , 47 S.Ct. 641 (1927)	143
<i>Dennis v. United States</i> , 341 U.S. 494 (1951)	146
<i>Brandenberg v. Ohio</i> 395 U.S. 444 (1968).....	156
5. CONTENT-NEUTRAL TIME, PLACE, AND MANNER RESTRICTIONS ON EXPRESSION	161
<i>Police Department of Chicago v. Mosley</i> , 408 U.S. 92 (1972).....	161
6. PURPOSE AND EFFECTS-BASED LIMITS ON FREE SPEECH	163

<i>Schneider v. State of New Jersey</i> , 60 S.Ct. 146 (1940)	163
<i>United States v. O'Brien</i> , 391 U.S. 367 (1968)	165
7. THE SPECIAL POSITION OF PRIOR RESTRAINTS ON EXPRESSION.....	167
<i>Near v. State of Minnesota</i> , 51 S.Ct. 625 (1931)	167
<i>Broadrick v. Oklahoma</i> , 413 U.S. 601 (1973)	170
Notes and Questions	175

CHAPTER 6

THE SCOPE OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION UNDER THE CHARTER

1. INTRODUCTION	178
2. GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION UNDER THE CHARTER... 179	
(a) The Supreme Court's First Endeavour	179
<i>R.W.D.S.U., Local 580 v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd.</i> , [1986] 2 S.C.R. 573	179
Notes and Questions	182
(b) The Supreme Court's Second Major Endeavour.....	184
<i>Ford v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1988] 2 S.C.R. 712	184
(c) The Supreme Court's Most Comprehensive Endeavour	185
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 927	185
Notes And Questions.....	195
<i>Reference Re Section 193 and 195.1 (1) (c) of the Criminal Code (Manitoba) (the Prostitution Reference)</i> [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1123	200
3. COMPELLED SPEECH -- A PRELIMINARY INQUIRY	202
<i>Slaight Communications Inc. v. Davidson</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 1038.....	202
Notes and Questions	204
<i>Lavigne v. Ontario Public Service Employee Union et al.</i> [1991] 2 S.C.R. 211	205
Notes and Questions	212
4. THE AMERICAN APPROACH TO THE PRIMA FACIE SCOPE OF FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	213
(A) The Categorical Exclusion of Certain Messages from the First Amendment.....	213
<i>Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire</i> , 315 U.S. 568 (1942).....	213
Notes and Questions	215
(B) The American Distinction Between Speech and Conduct.....	216
<i>United States v. O'Brien</i> , 391 U.S. 367 (1968).....	216
Notes and Questions	218
<i>Texas v. Johnson</i> , 109 S.Ct. 2533 (1989)	220
Notes and Questions	221
(C) The Severity of the Burden on Expression	223
<i>Rust, et al., v. Sullivan, Secretary of Health and Human Services; New York, et al.</i> , Supreme Court of the United States 111 S. Ct. 1759; 1991	223
Notes and Questions	230
5. FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND THE DEMOCRATIC/ELECTORAL PROCESS	231
<i>Haig v. Canada; Canada (Chief Electoral Officer)</i> [1993] 2 S.C.R. 995	231
Notes and Questions	240
<i>Siemens v. Manitoba (Attorney General)</i> , [2003] 1 S.C.R. 6, 2003 SCC 3.....	241

Notes and Questions	242
<i>Native Women's Assn. of Canada v. Canada</i> [1994] 3 S.C.R. 627	243
Notes and Questions	253
6. WHAT'S IN A NAME?	254
<i>Walker v. Prince Edward Island</i> [1995] 2 S.C.R. 407	254
Notes and Questions	255

CHAPTER 7

SUBVERSIVE AND UNPATRIOTIC EXPRESSION

1. INTRODUCTION	257
2. NOTE: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND THE OFFICIAL REGULATION OF THE CONTENT OF EXPRESSION	258
3. CANADIAN LAW ON SUBVERSIVE AND UNPATRIOTIC SPEECH.....	262
Criminal Code, R.S.C. 1985, c. C-46	262
Notes and Questions	263
4. THE FIRST AMENDMENT AND SUBVERSIVE AND UNPATRIOTIC SPEECH.....	265
<i>Cohen v. California</i> , 403 U.S. 215 (1971)	265
Notes and Questions	268
<i>Texas v. Johnson</i> , 109 S.Ct. 2533 (1989)	270
Notes and Questions	284

CHAPTER 8

FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION AND NATIONAL SECURITY

1. INTRODUCTION	287
2. BACKGROUND TO THE CANADIAN APPROACH	288
<i>Freedom and Security under the Law</i> , the Second Report of the Commission of Inquiry Concerning Certain Activities of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (August, 1981); Summary of Recommendations	288
<i>Canadian Security Intelligence Service Act</i> , R.S.C. 1985, c. C-23.....	288
3. DOES FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION PROTECT VIOLENT EXPRESSION?.....	289
<i>Suresh v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> , [2002] S.C.J. No. 3	289
<i>R. v. Khawaja</i> [2012] S.C.J. No. 69 (Supreme Court of Canada).....	292
Notes and Questions	298
4. PROHIBITING PUBLICATION OF MATERIALS THREATENING TO NATIONAL SECURITY.....	299
<i>New York Times v. United States</i> , 91 S.Ct. 2140 (1971)	299
<i>U.S. v. Progressive Inc.</i> , 467 F.Supp 990 (W.D. Wis. 1979).....	303
5. DO SPIES HAVE FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION?	304
<i>Snapp v. U.S.</i> , 100 S.Ct. 763 (1980)	304

CHAPTER 9

FALSE AND DEFAMATORY EXPRESSION

1. INTRODUCTION.....	307
2. CANADIAN LEGISLATION	308
<i>Criminal Code</i> , R.S.C. 1985 c. C-46, Part VIII -- Offences Against the Person	308
<i>Libel and Slander Act</i> , R.S.O. 1980 c. 237	311
3. U.S POSITION UNDER THE FIRST AMENDMENT	314
<i>New York Times Co. v. Sullivan</i> 376 U.S. 254 (1964)	314
Notes and Questions	321
<i>Hustler Magazine v. Falwell</i> 108 S.Ct. 876 (1988)	322
Notes and Questions	325
4. THE CANADIAN APPROACH	327
Notes and Questions	327
The Charter and Criminal Proceedings Over Questions of Truth and Falsehood:.....	330
<i>R. v. Zundel</i> [1992] 2 S.C.R. 731	330
Notes and Questions	336
<i>Hill v. Church of Scientology of Toronto and Manning</i> Supreme Court of Canada, unreported, released July 20, 1995	338
Notes And Questions.....	359
<i>R. v. Lucas</i> [1998] 1 S.C.R. 439.....	360
<i>Gilles E. Néron Communication Marketing Inc. v. Chambre des notaires du Québec</i> , [2004] S.C.J. No. 50.....	384
Notes and Questions	391
<i>WIC Radio Ltd. v. Simpson</i> , 2008 SCC 40 , [2008] S.C.J. No. 41	392
Notes and Questions	397
<i>Grant v. Torstar Corp.</i> [2009] S.C.J. No. 61 (SCC).....	398
Notes and Questions	424
<i>Bou Malhab v. Diffusion Métromédia CMR Inc.</i> [2011] S.C.J. No. 9.....	425
<i>Crookes v. Newton</i> [2011] S.C.J. No. 47	432
Notes and Questions	441

CHAPTER 10

CORPORATE AND COMMERCIAL EXPRESSION

1. INTRODUCTION	443
2. WHO CAN ASSERT SECTION 2(B) CLAIMS	446
<i>Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission</i> 558 U.S. 1 (2010) (U.S. Supreme Court).....	446
<i>Alberta (Information and Privacy Commissioner) v.... United Food and Commercial Workers, Local 401</i> [2013] S.C.J. No. 62 (Supreme Court of Canada)	451
Notes and Questions	457
3. COMMERCIAL EXPRESSION AND SECTION 2(b)	458
<i>Ford v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1988], 2 S.C.R. 712.....	458
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 927	463

Notes and Questions	465
4. PERMISSIBLE LIMITATIONS UNDER SECTION 1	468
a) Regulating the Use Of Languages Other Than French on Commercial Signs in Quebec.	468
<i>Ford v. A.G. Quebec</i> [1988] 2 S.C.R. 712	468
Notes and Questions	471
b) Regulation of Advertising Aimed at Children:	472
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (A.-G.)</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 927	472
Notes and Questions	480
c) Regulation of Professional Advertising:	481
<i>Rocket v. Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario</i> , [1990] 2 S.C.R. 232	481
Notes and Questions	486
<i>Peel v. Attorney Registration and Disciplinary Commission Of Illinois</i> , 109 S.Ct. 3240 (1989)....	490
Notes and Questions	497
d) Regulation of ‘Counter-Advertising’	497
<i>R. v. Guignard</i> , [2002] S.C.J. No. 16	498
5. RESTRICTIONS ON SOLICITATION OF HARMFUL OR IMMORAL CONDUCT	502
<i>Reference Re ss. 193 and 195.1(1)(c) of the Criminal Code (Man.)</i> , [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1123.....	502
Notes and Questions	512
<i>Canada (Attorney General) v. Bedford</i> [2013] S.C.J. No. 72	514
Notes and Questions	516
<i>RJR - MacDonald Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> , Supreme Court of Canada, unreported, released Sept. 21 1995.....	518
Notes And Questions.....	568
<i>Canada (Attorney General) v. JTI-Macdonald Corp.</i> [2007] S.C.J. No. 30	570
Notes and Questions	588
<i>Posadas de Puerto Rico Associates v. Tourism Co. of Puerto Rico</i> , 106 S. Ct. 2968 (1986)	590
Notes and Questions	593

